Beyond Search: Information Literacy, Special Collections, and the First Year

Stefanie R. Bluemle
Augustana College - Rock Island

Sarah M. Horowitz
Haverford College

Follow this and additional works at: http://digitalcommons.augustana.edu/libscifaculty

Part of the Information Literacy Commons

Augustana Digital Commons Citation
http://digitalcommons.augustana.edu/libscifaculty/2

This Presentation is brought to you for free and open access by the Library and Information Science at Augustana Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Library and Information Science: Faculty Scholarship & Creative Works by an authorized administrator of Augustana Digital Commons. For more information, please contact digitalcommons@augustana.edu.
Beyond Search

INFORMATION LITERACY, SPECIAL COLLECTIONS, AND THE FIRST YEAR

STEFANIE R. BLUEMLE
RESEARCH LIBRARIAN & INSTRUCTION COORDINATOR
AUGUSTANA COLLEGE (IL)

&

SARAH M. HOROWITZ
CURATOR OF RARE BOOKS AND MANUSCRIPTS & HEAD OF SPECIAL COLLECTIONS
HAVERFORD COLLEGE

FEBRUARY 18, 2014
Purpose

I. To argue that information literacy (IL)—including first-year IL—should shift its primary focus away from searching and toward higher-level skills

II. To illustrate what first-year IL outcomes and teaching strategies might look like with such an approach

III. To argue for the centrality of special collections in teaching transferable, high-level research and information skills to first-year students
Augustana’s First-Year Sequence*

**LSFY101**: What does it mean to be a liberally educated individual?

**LSFY102**: How does exploring the past deepen our understanding of the human condition?

**LSFY103**: How do we embrace the challenges of our diverse and changing world?

*See “General Education Studies (AGES),” Augustana College, https://www.augustana.edu/academics/majors--areas-of-study/general-education-studies.
## LSFY Skills Matrix (prior to 2013-14)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>LSFY 101</strong></th>
<th><strong>LSFY 102</strong></th>
<th><strong>LSFY 103</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Describe how information is organized</td>
<td>- Identify the means of accessing print and electronic information</td>
<td>- Master the research tools available for information retrieval</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Distinguish among different forms of information (books, articles, newspapers,</td>
<td>- Use bibliographical information to advance research</td>
<td>- Refine a research question by employing advanced search strategies in subject-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and web materials)</td>
<td>- Determine which forms of information are appropriate for a research topic</td>
<td>specific databases</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Use reference materials to select a topic and to locate reliable background</td>
<td>- Determine when interlibrary loan is appropriate and know how to use it</td>
<td>- Gather the appropriate sources through a combination of consulting bibliogra-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>information</td>
<td>- Distinguish between primary and secondary materials and determine which kind</td>
<td>phies, searching catalogs and databases, and chasing cited references</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Examine the use of indexes, databases, and bibliographies when searching for</td>
<td>of source is needed for a topic</td>
<td>- Evaluate resources based on authority, bias, currency, and relevance and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>information</td>
<td>- Select relevant popular and/or scholarly materials based on research needs</td>
<td>effectively integrate them into research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Search for books and/or chapters/essays in books in ALiCat and I-Share</td>
<td>- Formulate a search strategy using mapping concepts and/or subject headings</td>
<td>- Use a citation style appropriate to the task</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Distinguish between popular and scholarly materials</td>
<td>- Consider the authority, bias, currency and relevance of all resources</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Define a research question</td>
<td>- Format references appropriately in in-text citations and bibliographies</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Develop keywords for a simple search and use subject headings to expand the</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>search</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Explain why sources must be cited and demonstrate familiarity with MLA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>citation style</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Conference on the First-Year Experience – 18 Feb. 2014**
INFORMATION LITERACY—INCLUDING FIRST-YEAR IL—SHOULD SHIFT ITS PRIMARY FOCUS AWAY FROM SEARCHING AND TOWARD HIGHER-LEVEL SKILLS
Higher-Level Bloom Skills

Evaluation
Synthesis
Analysis
Application
Comprehension
Knowledge

Examples:
- evaluating sources (content as well as surface features)
- developing research questions

Examples:
- search mechanics
- manipulating databases

The Library’s Assessment Project

Quantitative Assessment
(fixed-choice quiz)
The Library’s Assessment Project

Performance-Based Assessment*

• In-class worksheets
• Questions targeted to specific learning outcomes

The Library’s Assessment Project

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LSFY 101</th>
<th>LSFY 102</th>
<th>LSFY 103</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-Describe how information is organized</td>
<td>-Identify the means of accessing print and electronic information</td>
<td>-Master the research tools available for information retrieval</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Use reference materials to select a topic and to locate reliable background information</strong></td>
<td><strong>Distinguish which forms of information are appropriate for a research topic</strong></td>
<td><strong>Refine a research question by employing advanced search strategies in subject-specific databases</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Examine the use of indexes, databases, and bibliographies when searching for information</td>
<td>-Distinguish between primary and secondary materials and determine which kind of source is needed for a topic</td>
<td>-Evaluate resources based on authority, bias, currency, and relevance and effectively integrate them into research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Search for books and/or chapters/essays in books in ALicat and</td>
<td>-Select relevant popular and/or scholarly materials based on research needs</td>
<td>-Use a citation style appropriate to the task</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Distinguish between popular and scholarly materials</strong></td>
<td>-Formulate a search strategy using mapping concepts and/or subject headings</td>
<td>-Consider the authority, bias, currency and relevance of all resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Develop keywords for a simple search and use subject headings to expand the search</td>
<td>-Consider the authority, bias, currency and relevance of all resources</td>
<td>-Format references appropriately in in-text citations and bibliographies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Explain why sources must be cited and demonstrate familiarity with MLA citation style</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Results of the Assessment Project

Students *most easily* learned skills such as:

- Navigating Library of Congress classification
- Locating on-topic articles in databases
- Employing database limiters
- (By the end of the year), deciphering new or unfamiliar databases
Students were *most challenged* by skills such as:

- Using research to shape/inform the development of topics and research questions
- Selecting the best sources from among several on-topic options. For example:
  - Determining source type beyond the database record (e.g., research vs. review articles)
  - Evaluating sources’ purpose/arguments
From a study of first-year students, four “categories of difficulties”:

- “Formulating effective and efficient online searches
- “Identifying, selecting, and locating sources
- “Reading, comprehending, and summarizing materials
- “Figuring out faculty’s expectations for research assignments”*

From a study of second- to fourth-year students, the most difficult parts of the research process:

1. “Getting started is difficult
2. “Defining a topic
3. “Narrowing down a topic
4. “Filtering irrelevant results”*

Recommendations

“We recommend modifying [library] sessions (in-class and reference encounters) so they emphasize research process--framing a successful research process--over research-finding of sources.”*

“We think it is essential librarians teach students transferable information concepts that are integrated into lower and upper division courses, instead of focusing on search skills in brief encounters with students.”**

“[T]he results of our assessment project support decreasing the emphasis on search in LSFY library visits and increasing the emphasis on evaluative and analytical skills . . . [such as] developing topics and research questions, evaluating sources, and articulating sources’ role in the research project.”†

*Truth Be Told, 39; original emphasis.

**Learning the Ropes, 32; emphasis added.

† Thomas Tredway Library, Augustana College, “Assessment Report” (unpublished manuscript, October 3, 2013); original emphasis.
WHAT MIGHT FIRST-YEAR INFORMATION LITERACY LEARNING OUTCOMES AND TEACHING STRATEGIES LOOK LIKE WITH SUCH AN APPROACH?
# Revised LSFY Skills Matrix*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>LSFY 101</th>
<th>LSFY 102</th>
<th>LSFY 103</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Writing Skills</strong></td>
<td><strong>The Writing Process</strong>&lt;br&gt;-Exploratory writing&lt;br&gt;-Revision (with an emphasis on bringing out the line of your argument)</td>
<td>Continued practice with process writing . . . + <strong>Writing with Sources</strong>&lt;br&gt;-Summarizing&lt;br&gt;-Documentation&lt;br&gt;-Entering the conversation</td>
<td>Continued practice with process writing and writing with sources . . . + <strong>Multi-source Case-Building Essay</strong>&lt;br&gt;-Putting multiple sources into conversation with one another&lt;br&gt;-Selecting and interpreting evidence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Reading Skills</strong></td>
<td>Exploring reading through annotation and asking questions</td>
<td>Summarizing/Paraphrasing</td>
<td>Identifying points of agreement and disagreement between texts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Oral Communication Skills</strong></td>
<td>Exploring ideas through class discussion</td>
<td>Presenting information</td>
<td>Persuading audiences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Information Literacy Skills</strong></td>
<td>Exploratory research to generate ideas and questions</td>
<td>Evaluating sources based on the research need</td>
<td>Synthesizing diverse sources to develop and address a research question</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


(Continues with common readings/experiences)
First-Year Information Literacy Outcomes*

- **LSFY101**: Exploratory research to generate ideas and questions
- **LSFY102**: Evaluating sources based on the research need
- **LSFY103**: Synthesizing diverse sources to develop and address a research question

*“LSFY Skills Matrix.”

Teaching Strategies

LSFY101 – Rhetoric & the Liberal Arts – [Faculty member]
Librarian: Stefanie Bluemle (stefaniebluemle@augustana.edu)

Which of the papers you wrote this term do you want focus on during this class period? Recap the main argument you made in that paper here:

Spend the rest of the class period looking for sources relevant to the topic of that paper. Your goal is to find a source that can help you develop, revise, or re-think your argument for the paper. Any source that doesn’t develop your thinking in some way is probably not a good choice!

Focus on these resources:
• [provide a list]

At the end of the class period, choose the source that has done the most to develop your thinking so far about the paper. If it’s a book, consider checking it out. If it’s an article, consider printing a copy to take with you. Write a citation for the source you chose:

“How might your revised paper look different with this source to inform your thinking?”

LSFY101: Exploratory research to generate ideas and questions.

Lesson:

Students identify one source that can develop their thinking as they work to revise a paper.
Teaching Strategies

**LSFY102:** Evaluating sources based on the research need

**Lesson:**

1. In groups, students examine two or more sources and rank them from “best” to “worst” for the assignment; discuss as a class

2. Librarian demonstrates how to find a “good” source using databases

3. Students each identify one source for their own projects and justify decision in a paragraph

*See also Bluemle, Makula, and Rogal, “Learning by Doing,” 307-308.
**Teaching Strategies**

**LSFY103: Synthesizing diverse sources to develop and address a research question**

**Lesson:**

Students select two sources that help them refine an initial, broad topic or research question (or develop a topic into a question)

**Developing a Topic or Research Question**

1. As you begin to think about this project, what topic or question would you like to explore?

2. Where will you begin your research?
   - Reference collection
   - ALiCat/browsing the book stacks
   - Explore databases

3. Select two sources you have found that will help you explore your subject.
   a.
   b.

4. After reviewing the two sources, what does your idea looks like now? How have the two sources helped you refine or narrow your topic or question?

   Write a short paragraph reflecting on these questions.

   “How have the two sources helped you refine or narrow your topic or question?”

Part III

SPECIAL COLLECTIONS SHOULD BE CENTRAL TO TEACHING TRANSFERABLE, HIGH-LEVEL RESEARCH AND INFORMATION SKILLS TO FIRST-YEAR STUDENTS
Special Collections and First-Year Students

- Outcomes mentioned designed to include Special Collections
- Inherently inquiry-based and hands-on
- No reason not to use Special Collections with first-year students

“engaging [first-year students] with thoughtfully selected materials from our collections early in their college careers contributes to their cognitive development and critical thinking skills”*


Background

Grew organically out of what we were already doing

- ~25% of first-year students use Special Collections every year
- Many start as early as their first term
- Steadily increasing usage over past ten years
Special Collections Outcomes

- Have students become familiar with the existence and resources of Special Collections (101)
- Provide interesting, unusual, and unique content for students to explore (101)
- Evaluate and analyze documents (102)
- Learn to frame a research question or topic so as to be able to communicate with a librarian and get the materials they need (103)
- Set expectations and guidelines for use of the materials
Hands-On Work with Materials

- Spend significant time with materials
  - At least the length of one class
  - Return visits are preferable
- Librarian can prepare a variety of materials before class
- Include introduction to handling materials
- Have students discuss their materials so that they can compare the types of sources and analysis techniques

Exercise: Analyze all aspects of an original primary source

Lesson

Ask questions of the document, consider its format and physical aspects, connect on an emotional level

Document Analysis

What did you find in these documents that seems surprising, unexpected, or that provokes an emotional response? Consider their content, as well as their appearance and “packaging.”

What questions do the documents raise?

Why do you think these documents were created? Who created them? For whom?

How are the two documents similar? How are they different?

Why is it important to look at these types of documents? What can you learn from them? What is different about the experience of working with these documents compared to other sources you have used? (This could include fiction, scholarly articles, online sources, etc. depending on the content of the class.)
New Types of Analyses

- Unique and unusual sources
- Encourage students to analyze visual and physical aspects of materials
- Influence of original materials
Choosing Collections

- Do not need large collection of rare materials
- Nor do materials have to be very old
- Something students can connect to
- Most important is to defamiliarize the research process for students and to force them to think in new ways about research and documents
Coming Full Circle

- Now assessing our work in Special Collections
- Very little assessment on teaching and learning in special collections, let alone with first-year students
- Initial surveys showed that students were learning some of the things we hoped they were
- Piloting an assessment project studying special collections and information literacy
Part IV
Conclusion, Part I

- Using assessment to re-evaluate and change outcomes allows you to address what students on your particular campus are struggling with.
- Librarians should move pedagogy beyond search to focus more on higher-level information literacy skills.
- Special Collections is a valuable partner in teaching a wide variety of information literacy skills to first-year students, and should be part of an integrated information literacy instruction program.
Conclusion, Part II

- This type of program allows for building on information literacy skills in the major and towards senior seminars
- The assessment cycle is always recursive: now we’re assessing the changes we have made and the work of special collections
- This may sound like something amazing and different, but it’s quite easy to do on your own campus
Questions?

- Stefanie R. Bluemle
  stefaniebluemle@augustana.edu

- Sarah M. Horowitz
  shorowitz@haverford.edu