

Augustana College

## Augustana Digital Commons

---

2020 Festschrift: Georg Frideric Handel's  
"Messiah"

Festschriften

---

Fall 12-11-2020

### Music Composition in the 17th and 18th centuries: A Historical Analysis of how Georg Frideric Handel Participated in "Borrowing"

Nicholas Mueller

*Augustana College, Rock Island Illinois*

Oscar Peterson-Veatch

*Augustana College, Rock Island Illinois*

Russell Schmidt

*Augustana College, Rock Island Illinois*

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.augustana.edu/muscfest2020>



Part of the [European History Commons](#), and the [Musicology Commons](#)

---

#### Augustana Digital Commons Citation

Mueller, Nicholas; Peterson-Veatch, Oscar; and Schmidt, Russell. "Music Composition in the 17th and 18th centuries: A Historical Analysis of how Georg Frideric Handel Participated in "Borrowing"" (2020). *2020 Festschrift: Georg Frideric Handel's "Messiah"*.

<https://digitalcommons.augustana.edu/muscfest2020/4>

This Student Paper is brought to you for free and open access by the Festschriften at Augustana Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in 2020 Festschrift: Georg Frideric Handel's "Messiah" by an authorized administrator of Augustana Digital Commons. For more information, please contact [digitalcommons@augustana.edu](mailto:digitalcommons@augustana.edu).

*Music Composition in the 17th and 18th centuries:  
A Historical Analysis of how Georg Frideric Handel Participated in "Borrowing"*

Nicholas Mueller  
Oscar Peterson-Veatch  
Russell Schmidt

Augustana College  
MUSC 311--Styles and Literature of Music I  
December 9, 2020

Abstract:

The primary focus in this research paper is borrowing; this means borrowing from other composers, and self-borrowing from a previous composition. It is widely accepted in scholarship that Georg Frideric Handel participated in the action of borrowing. However, there is significantly more contention among scholars surrounding both the extent of Handel's borrowing, as well as what the appropriate modern perspective is for these actions. In this research paper our primary focus will be on Handel's borrowings, the benefits he received from these actions, and the historical lens of borrowing in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries.

Georg Frederic Handel was born in 1685, in Halle, Germany.<sup>1</sup> As he began to compose music, Handel, like many other composers at the time, started borrowing from the musical landscape around him. Handel did not perceive this behavior as inappropriate, in part, because of the significant precedent of borrowing propagated by many composers before his time. In the study of music history, the borrowing featured in Handel's compositions has been debated for over a century. The question still remains to be argued as to whether or not this behavior was appropriate. In consideration of the morality of Handel's borrowings there are three topics that need to be discussed: the forms of copyright available in Handel's time period, the benefits Handel received from such borrowings, and the extent of Handel's borrowings.

When Handel moved to London in 1714, copyright laws were already established. In 1474, William Caxton introduced the printing trade to England.<sup>2</sup> When printing became more available, copying became simpler. It was not until the Catholic Counter-Reformation began, that anyone began to regulate reproduction of works. As David Tucker describes in "The History of Publishing" from the Britannica encyclopedia, when the Inquisition was reinstated, it placed restrictions on the printing and selling of books.<sup>3</sup> This trend of controlling publication continued in England, even with a shift in ecclesiastical power. With King George I's institution of the Copyright Act of 1709, England finally had a legal definition of copyright that allowed publishers to charge readers a demarcated amount. Despite the copyright law in place, there was no recompense that Handel needed. This meant that Handel borrowed frequently throughout many portions of his life, and his affiliation with King George I prohibited any pursuit of legal action. Additionally, the Copyright Act did not explicitly condemn the reproduction of music.

Although the copyright laws were not yet an effective deterrent for borrowing while Handel was alive, the patriarchy certainly held power over composers. A musician's main form of income in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries was through patrons. The wealthy would employ

---

<sup>1</sup> Hicks, Anthony. "Handel [Händel, Hendel], George Frideric." *Grove Music Online*. 2001; Accessed 13 Sep. 2020.

<sup>2</sup> Tucker, David H, and Editors of Encyclopedia Britannica. "History of Printing" *Encyclopædia Britannica*. Encyclopædia Britannica, inc., October 1, 2020. <https://www.britannica.com/topic/publishing>. 10.

<sup>3</sup> Tucker. "History of Printing," 10.

court musicians to compose and perform for them during mealtimes and for special events.<sup>4</sup> A patron would supply the musician they were employing with a pension. Sometimes, the employment would also include housing.<sup>5</sup> The average musician's pension in the late 1600's and early 1700's was about £50 a year. Because of Handel's status as a composer, he was able to secure two pensions, both worth £200, and a house. According to David Hunter, in his book *The Lives of George Frideric Handel*, in the last 30 years of his life, Handel was among the 0.3% most wealthy in Europe.<sup>6</sup> His prowess as a composer allowed him to make £400 a year in the eighteenth century. In David Hunter's article, "Patronizing Handel, Inventing Audiences: The Intersections of Class, Money, Music and History," he writes that Handel seemed to have an even larger income of £600; this would potentially place him in an even smaller percent of the most wealthy.<sup>7</sup> For perspective, taking inflation into account, £400 in the eighteenth century is worth approximately \$80,643.61 today.<sup>8</sup> This amount of money is not only significantly higher than any musician's income at the time, it is a large amount of money for anyone employed then. It is clear that Handel benefited immensely from the borrowing in which he participated. This provided him a reputation as a fantastic composer.

The extent of Handel's borrowings can be observed in the discussion of this behavior by modern music history scholars. One such scholar is Anthony Hicks. In his article entitled, "Handel [Händel, Hendel], George Frideric [Georg Friederich]," Hicks discusses the subject of Handel's borrowing:

"The question of 'borrowing' — the convenient term for Handel's re-use of musical material both from his own works and, especially, those of other composers...in this respect he may not have been untypical of composers of the period, especially those working in the theatre."<sup>9</sup>

<sup>4</sup> Hunter, David. *The Lives of George Frideric Handel*. Woodbridge, UK: Boydell Press, 2015, 172.

<sup>5</sup> Hunter, *Lives of George Frideric Handel*, 174-175.

<sup>6</sup> Hunter, *Lives of George Frideric Handel*, 176.

<sup>7</sup> Hunter, David. "Patronizing Handel, Inventing Audiences: The Intersections of Class, Money, Music and History." *Early Music* 28, no. 1 (2000): 33-49. Accessed December 5, 2020. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3518970>, 8.

<sup>8</sup> Alan Eliassen. Historical Currency Conversion. Accessed December 5, 2020. <https://futureboy.us/fsp/dollar.fsp?quantity=400&cy=pounds&fromYear=1713>.

<sup>9</sup> Hicks. "Handel [Händel, Hendel], George Frideric." 30.

Hicks mentions the relevance of Handel's borrowings in the consideration of his works. One cannot look at Handel's works without considering the possibility that another composer conceptualized the motive or the counterpoint. Additionally, one should note that Hicks' claims that the self-borrowing observed in Handel's composition was common among other composers of the time period. In his book, *Handel: A Symposium*, Gerald Abraham affirms these ideas: "[Handel] was so much the man of his time that these borrowings are completely assimilated, and suspected as such only when someone comes across the original."<sup>10</sup> Handel's borrowings were a product of his time period. Abraham expounds upon the concept of originality until proven otherwise. He attests that most of Handel's works are not, or cannot be checked for originality.

Though one could question Handel's originality in a broad spectrum of his works, there are a few instances of borrowing that stand out. Handel not only borrowed from other composers, but borrowed from himself. As Gerald Abraham outlines in the chapter titled, "Some Points of Style,"<sup>11</sup> Handel borrows from his opera *Giustino* and implements a motive into his trio sonata Op. 5, No.6:

Example 1:

The image shows a musical score for a Largo section. It features four staves: Violin I (Viol. I.), Violin II (Viol. II.), a vocal line with lyrics, and a basso continuo line (Cemb.). The tempo is marked "Larghetto." and the dynamics are "p" (piano) and "p senza Cemb." (piano without harpsichord). The lyrics are "Può ben — na — scer tra li bo — schi no — bil". The vocal line includes a trill (tr) above the first measure.

Abraham, Gerald. *Handel: A Symposium*. London, England: Oxford University Press, 1954. [https://ks.imslp.net/files/imglnks/usimg/6/67/IMSLP19080-PMLP44872-HG\\_Band\\_88.pdf](https://ks.imslp.net/files/imglnks/usimg/6/67/IMSLP19080-PMLP44872-HG_Band_88.pdf). Page 24.

<sup>10</sup> Abraham, Gerald. *Handel: A Symposium*. London, England: Oxford University Press, 1954. 267

<sup>11</sup> Abraham. *Handel: A Symposium*, 267.

Example 2:

MENUETT.  
*Allegro moderato.*

**B.**  
(c. pag. 193)

6 6

6 6 6 7 7

Abraham, Gerald. *Handel: A Symposium*. London, England: Oxford University Press, 1954.

[https://ks4.imslp.info/files/imglnks/usimg/f/f9/IMSLP275234-PMLP446953-Handel\\_son\\_Op\\_5\\_Chrys.pdf](https://ks4.imslp.info/files/imglnks/usimg/f/f9/IMSLP275234-PMLP446953-Handel_son_Op_5_Chrys.pdf). Page 43.

This borrowing, which recurs frequently, can hardly be considered stealing. Although the borrowing presented recites unoriginal material, Handel is borrowing from himself. An argument could be made that these borrowings, or references, are a disservice to the audience members of his works. However, one must also remember the context of these works. Harpsichord works were not meant for the general public.<sup>12</sup> The harpsichord was played in the homes of the aristocracy, not in a concert hall. The trio sonata was more for background music than anything else, generally commissioned by a patron. The only composition that earned a significant amount of money, ignoring payment from the aristocracy that employed Handel, would be opera. Since this borrowing comes from opera and is implemented in a trio sonata, the argument that paying audience members were disserved is largely invalid.

The aforementioned references consider Handel borrowing in his instrumental works; however, Handel often included different composer's music in many of his other compositions. These forms, in Handel's time, would net a large sum of money. In this case, Handel's borrowings can be described as stealing. Of course, wherever one draws the financial line between borrowing and stealing in composition is subjective. Larger portions of borrowing are paralleled in Handel's oratorio and opera. These appropriations have more consequences than the previously mentioned

<sup>12</sup> Abraham. *Handel: A Symposium*, 267.

borrowings; this provides uncertainty surrounding the morality of them, which is why one might describe these borrowings as stealings. There is direct evidence that in *La Resurrezione*, *Agrippina*, and *Rodrigo*, Handel stole from Reinhard Keiser's opera, *Octavia*. Sedley Taylor, the author of a book titled, *The Indebtedness of Handel to Works by Other Composers: A Presentation of Evidence*, outlines the first borrowing to look at is from Handel's *La Resurrezione* where, in an aria sung by Lucifer, Handel steals directly from Keiser's opera and transposes down one whole step<sup>13</sup>:

Example 3:

**Ex. 47.**

From a song sung by 'Lucifer' in Handel's cantata "*La Resurrezione*" (Rome, 1708.)

Handel.  
(*Resurrezione*.)

O voi dell' E - re - bo po - ten - ze or - ri - bi - li

Bass of Symphony to the song "*Costante ognor*." (*Octavia*.)  
Keiser.  
(*Octavia*.)  
p. 147.  
(Transposed  
a Tone down.)

Taylor, Sedley. 2014. *The Indebtedness of Handel to Works by Other Composers: a Presentation of Evidence*. Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press. Page 170.

Handel also borrows from *Octavia*, "*Ruhig Sein*," placing a similar motive in *Agrippina*, "*Vaghe Fonte*:"

Example 4:

**Ex. 48.**

Symphony to the song "*Vaghe Fonte*." (*Agrippina*, 1708.)

Handel.  
*Agrippina*.

Symphony to the song "*Ruhig sein*."  
Keiser.  
*Octavia*.  
p. 12.  
(Transposed  
a Tone  
down.)

Taylor, Sedley. 2014. *The Indebtedness of Handel to Works by Other Composers: a Presentation of Evidence*. Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press. Page 171.

<sup>13</sup> Taylor, Sedley. 2014. *The Indebtedness of Handel to Works by Other Composers: a Presentation of Evidence*. Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press, 168.



Furthermore, Handel borrows from *Octavia's*, "Es Streiten mit reizender Blüthe" in *Rodrigo's*, "Dell' Iberia al soglio:"

Example 5:  
**Ex. 46.**

Symphony to the song "Dell' Iberia al soglio" (*Rodrigo*, Handel's first Italian opera, Florence 1707.)

Symphony to the song "Es streiten mit reizender Blüthe." (*Octavia*.)

Keiser.  
p. 84.  
Transposed  
one Tone  
down.

Taylor, Sedley. 2014. *The Indebtedness of Handel to Works by Other Composers: a Presentation of Evidence*. Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press. Page 169.

As mentioned above, oratorios and operas earned more money, so it is more questionable for Handel to borrow this material. Since these borrowings are from an individual's single composition, it is possible these borrowings are an homage. One must consider the possibility that a composer like Handel wished to honor and learn from Keiser, a well-respected German composer of the time. Not to mention there is a possibility that Handel might have attended a live performance of *Octavia* that would have influenced his compositions. The morality of these borrowings is questionable. Therefore, one should examine what musicologists argue.

The debate surrounding whether or not Handel borrowed from himself, borrowed from other composers, or if he stole altogether, is ongoing amongst musicologists. However, Handel is still being accused of borrowing from numerous composers. Charles Carroll, professor of music at St. Petersburg Junior College and music critic for the *St. Petersburg Independent*, believes that Handel could have borrowed from composers including Keiser, Kerll, Kuhnau, Muffat, Telemann, and Urio, to name a few. Sedley Taylor, discusses the issue of Handel's musical borrowing. Taylor confirms the statement made by Carroll:

"The similarities are too minute and extensive to be accounted for either by fortuitous coincidence or by unconscious reminiscence... he accepted, indeed practically claimed, merit for what he must have known was not his own work."<sup>14</sup>

Musicologists provide proof that shows Handel borrowed a large amount from works that were not his own. Potentially more important, Sedley notes that Handel was prideful and enjoyed the merit that he received from his explicit borrowings.<sup>15</sup> Despite the extensive proof regarding Handel's borrowing, further investigation reveals a dispute in music history academia.

Although scholars have found borrowings from multiple sources, many presumed borrowings are chronologically implausible. Notwithstanding the long list of accusations regarding Handel's borrowings, there are many instances where the circumstances at the time should have prevented him from seeing the emulated scores. Ralph Leavis, a musician and musicologist, cites the reasoning as to why in some instances Handel, did not borrow from others. An example of this comes from Rameau's, "*Pièces de clavecin en concerts*," in the fourth movement entitled 'La Forqueray':

Example 6a and 6b:

Ex. 4 (a)

(b)

Leavis, Ralph. "Three Impossible Handel Borrowings." *The Musical Times* 123, no. 1673 (1982): 470-71. Page 471.

<sup>14</sup> Carroll, Charles Michael. "Musical Borrowing-Grand Larceny or Great Art?" *College Music Symposium* vol. 18, no. 1 (1978), 17.

<sup>15</sup> Carroll, Charles Michael, "Musical Borrowing-Grand Larceny or Great Art?", 17.

Leavis uses two examples, example 6a being the opening of the fourth movement and example 6b being a passage from the Allegro of the overture to Handel's *Joseph*. When observing the timeline Leavis found that Rameau's *Pièces* were published in 1741, and Handel composed *Joseph* in August and September 1743. However, the obvious conclusion of borrowing is illogical, because of the war taking place in France; Handel is not likely to have known anything published at that period.<sup>16</sup> Unless Telemann sent over pieces of music through a diplomatic bag to ensure its safety during the war, it is unlikely that Handel borrowed from Rameau.

Another example of an improbable borrowing is found in the manuscript (MS) treatise from Francesco Veracini, "*Il trionfo della pratica musicale*," and a section of Handel's *Messiah*. Example 7 is an excerpt from the beginning of *Messiah*, and example 8 is an excerpt from Veracini's MS treatise. The note lengths, direction of their motion, and basic elements of the key and time signature are homogenous. The resultant simplicity of Handel's composition compared to Veracini's complex rhythmic and harmonic work provides evidence for yet another instance of borrowing.

Example 7:



Leavis, Ralph. "Three Impossible Handel Borrowings." *The Musical Times* 123, no. 1673 (1982): 470-71. Page 471.

Example 8:

Leavis, Ralph. "Three Impossible Handel Borrowings." *The Musical Times* 123, no. 1673 (1982): 470-71. Page 471.

<sup>16</sup> Leavis, Ralph, "Three Impossible Handel Borrowings", *The Musical Times* Vol. 123, No. 1673: 14.

Leavis explains that attention should be focused on the impossibility that Handel had knowledge of Veracini's fugue. Leavis claims that the fugue was lost at sea soon after 1745, and the extant version was later reconstructed from memory.<sup>17</sup> There is little evidence for what sources Handel possessed concerning the lost fugue. Some speculate that Corelli and Handel met in Italy and discussed the fugue, which could be where the inspiration in *Messiah* comes from.<sup>18</sup>

In consideration of the morality of Handel's borrowings, three relevant topics are: the forms of copyright available in Handel's time period, the benefits Handel received from such borrowings, and the extent of Handel's borrowings. During Handel's time, there was the Copyright Act of 1709 which defined the legal restrictions on literature reproduction. However, the Copyright Act did not explicitly condemn Handel's borrowing. Handel's behavior allowed him to climb to within 0.3% of the most wealthy people in Europe and provided him a reputation as a brilliant composer. This leads to the conclusion that Handel's borrowing earned him a disproportionate amount of profit and potentially inflated reputation. Moreover, there is evidence he claimed merit for those from which he borrowed. These allegations place further uncertainty on the morality of Handel's borrowing. Handel's borrowing from himself, other composers, or stole altogether allows for one to question the motive of Handel's borrowing. Although there is substantial evidence that supports the claim that Handel's borrowing is amoral and problematic, this is subjective and should be left to personal interpretation.

---

<sup>17</sup> Leavis, "Three Impossible Handel Borrowings", 471.

<sup>18</sup> Leavis, "Three Impossible Handel Borrowings", 471.

Works Cited

- Abraham, Gerald. *Handel: A Symposium*. London, England: Oxford University Press, 1954.
- Abraham, Gerald. *Handel: A Symposium*. London, England: Oxford University Press, 1954.  
[https://ks.imslp.net/files/imglnks/usimg/6/67/IMSLP19080-PMLP44872-HG\\_Band\\_88.pdf](https://ks.imslp.net/files/imglnks/usimg/6/67/IMSLP19080-PMLP44872-HG_Band_88.pdf).
- Abraham, Gerald. *Handel: A Symposium*. London, England: Oxford University Press, 1954.  
[https://ks4.imslp.info/files/imglnks/usimg/f/f9/IMSLP275234-PMLP446953-Handel\\_son\\_Op\\_5\\_Chrys.pdf](https://ks4.imslp.info/files/imglnks/usimg/f/f9/IMSLP275234-PMLP446953-Handel_son_Op_5_Chrys.pdf).
- Alan Eliassen. Historical Currency Conversion. Accessed December 5, 2020.  
<https://futureboy.us/fsp/dollar.fsp?quantity=400&cy=pounds&fromYear=1713>.
- Carroll, Charles Michael. "Musical Borrowing-Grand Larceny or Great Art?" *College Music Symposium* 18, no. 1 (1978): 11-18. Accessed November 7, 2020.
- Hicks, Anthony. "Handel [Händel, Hendel], George Frideric." *Grove Music Online*. 2001; Accessed 13 Sep. 2020.
- Hunter, David. *The Lives of George Frideric Handel*. Woodbridge, UK: Boydell Press, 2015.
- Hunter, David. "Patronizing Handel, Inventing Audiences: The Intersections of Class, Money, Music and History." *Early Music* 28, no. 1 (2000): 33-49. Accessed December 5, 2020.  
<http://www.jstor.org/stable/3518970>.
- Leavis, Ralph. "Three Impossible Handel Borrowings." *The Musical Times* 123, no. 1673 (1982): 470-71. Accessed September 13, 2020.

Taylor, Sedley. 2014. *The Indebtedness of Handel to Works by Other Composers: a Presentation of Evidence*. Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press.

Tucker, David H, and Editors of Encyclopedia Britannica. "History of Printing" *Encyclopædia Britannica*. Encyclopædia Britannica, inc., October 1, 2020. Accessed October 30, 2020.

Annotated Bibliography

Abraham, Gerald. *Handel: A Symposium*. London, England: Oxford University Press, 1954.

The book has arguments on Handel's borrowings such as Handel's borrowing from Keiser's opera *Octavia* in the aria 'Constante ognor' from *La Resurrezione*. There are many examples like this in the book. This author seems to claim that Handel's borrowings were justified as an action associated with the times.

Burkholder, J. Peter. "Borrowing." *Grove Music Online*. 2001; Accessed 13 Sep.

2020. <https://proxy.augustana.edu:2509/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000052918>.

Another source that discusses the topic of borrowings is this *Grove* article which sets the framework for a discussion. This source is invaluable, considering that it also includes sections that, at the minimum, generalize Handel's borrowings. There is specificity of where Handel borrowed, as well as borrowings of Handel's works in later time periods.

Carroll, Charles Michael. "Musical Borrowing-Grand Larceny or Great Art?" *College Music*

*Symposium* 18, no. 1 (1978): 11-18. Accessed November 7, 2020.

<http://www.jstor.org/stable/40373912>.

This book describes the total amount of accused borrowings that Handel has taken from. It also goes over the things that could have been going on during the time that how all of these accusations around the same time and from composers goes to show that there is a strong reason to believe he must have borrowed from some of the composers that accused him.

Dean, Winton. *Handel's Dramatic Oratorios and Masques*. London, England: Oxford University Press, 1959.

This book details Handel's oratorios, categorizing and explaining each individual one by section. Even at a cursory glance, there are explanations to borrowings and full plot explanations. This can be an exemplary source for background, and analysis.

Flower, Newman. *George Frideric Handel: His Personality and His Times*. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1948.

*George Frideric Handel: His Personality and His Times*, a book by Newman Flower details the historical context of George Frideric Handel and his relatives. The book contains a large amount of broad information about George Frideric Handel's life. This source may be useful to inform the reader about periods of time in Handel's life that might warrant more detailed research. However, the source contains a significant amount of biased language and is severely lacking appropriate citation. Any information used from this source will need to be carefully analyzed.

Gudger, William D. "A Borrowing from Kerll in 'Messiah'." *The Musical Times* 118, no. 1618 (1977): 1038-039. Accessed September 8, 2020. doi:10.2307/959356.

This article goes into some specific areas in Handel's *Messiah* that may be attributed to Johan Kerll. It is a small article, but there are examples within the article and material that states why Handel most likely took the original music from Kerll and used it in *Messiah*. The examples given may be beneficial to include as images and throughout our writing.



Hicks, Anthony. "Handel [Händel, Hendel], George Frideric." *Grove Music Online*. 2001; Accessed 13 Sep. 2020.

Hicks brings up multiple points referring to the times that Handel was called out during the years he was composing the pieces. He even refers back to the Kerll - Handel article that I first found. Stating that *Israel in Egypt* was essentially copied by Handel from a canzona done by J.K. Kerll. Hicks also brings up that the 1730s was the most notable time that Handel was called out for taking others' music.

Kim, Minji. "Significance and Effect of the Stile Antico in Handel's Oratorios." *Early Music* 39, no. 4 (2011): 563-73. Accessed September 20, 2020.

Kim points out Handel's *Israel in Egypt* oratorio and is able to compare Kerll's work and Handel's *Messiah* work to each other. This article really supports Hicks' article which compares the same similarities. Kim mainly looks into some of Handel's oratorios and focuses on those in which Handel uses *stile antico*.

Hunter, David. *The Lives of George Frideric Handel*. Woodbridge, UK: Boydell Press, 2015.

*The Lives of George Frideric Handel*, a book by David Hunter, investigates the various biographies written about Handel's life. Hunter writes about the efficacy of many of these entries while also summarizing the common details and facts about Handel's life among the biographies. Additionally, He also discusses the subject of patrons and Handel's income. Handel's income and monetary worth is what will be most useful for historical analysis.

Leavis, Ralph. "Three Impossible Handel Borrowings." *The Musical Times* 123, no. 1673 (1982): 470-71. Accessed September 13, 2020. doi:10.2307/963240.

Leavis' article gives multiple examples of areas within Handel's compositions that are too similar to not be copied works. He gives four examples of pieces with actual music excerpts within each passage. Showing that Handel took parts of music from different people would further prove the extent that he went to copy other composers' works.

Meynell, Hugo. *The Art of Handel's Operas*. The Edwin Mellen Press, 1986.

*The Art of Handel's Opera*, a book by Hugo Meynell, contends that there are thirty-nine operas composed by Handel that require further attention be paid to them. Meynell argues the significance of each of the thirty-nine operas. He also includes brief summative historical context for each composition. This source will be useful for identifying any similarities between operas Handel has written and other compositions.

Myers, Robert M. *Handel's Messiah*. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1948.

*Handel's Messiah*, a book by Robert Myers, portrays the historical context of Handel's *Messiah*. The introduction describes it as "a biography of Handel's masterpiece," (xxi). This source provides detailed information and analysis on Handel's *Messiah*. It will be useful as a resource for comparing *Messiah* to other compositions; potentially even highlighting some areas in *Messiah* where Handel's "borrowing" can be seen.

Payne, Ian. "Another Händel Borrowing from Telemann?. Capital Gains." *The Musical Times* 142, no. 1874 (2001): 33-42. Accessed September 13, 2020. doi:10.2307/1004680.

Ian Payne's analysis of Handel's borrowings from Telemann is enlightening.

Not only is it important to question how Handel borrowed, but where Handel borrowed from. It's interesting that Handel borrows and steals from a contemporary. This source can supplement information, as well, about how his contemporaries felt about his borrowings.

Shedlock, J. S. "Handel's Borrowings (Concluded)." *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular* 42, no. 703 (1901): 596-600. Accessed September 6, 2020. doi: 10.2307/3366025.

*Handel's Borrowings*, a journal article written by J.S. Shedlock, summarizes the inquiry that had been done up until 1901 into possible plagiarism committed by George Frideric Handel. Despite being more than a hundred years old, this source will be very helpful to direct further research. The article contains a list of composers that Handel allegedly plagiarized. This list will be singularly useful both as a resource and, if more recent sources can be found to reinforce the claims, as a contextually significant source.

Taylor, Sedley. 2014. *The Indebtedness of Handel to Works by Other Composers: a Presentation of Evidence*. Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press.

This text provides prime examples of borrowing. The borrowings listed in this book are side-by-side as well, providing an easy comparison. The borrowings within this source include works by Reinhard Keiser, a fairly prolific writer of the time.

Tucker, David H, and Editors of Encyclopedia Britannica. "History of Printing" *Encyclopædia Britannica*. Encyclopædia Britannica, inc., October 1, 2020. <https://www.britannica.com/topic/publishing>.

David H. Tucker, in his Britannica entry on "Publishing" explicates in the section, "History of Printing" about the many reforms of printing throughout

England. He begins with details about the Protestant reformation. This spurs into a description of the Catholic church's copyright acts, and divulges the overarching history of printing and publishing.

Winemiller, John T. "Recontextualizing Handel's Borrowing." *The Journal of Musicology* 15, no. 4 (1997): 444-70. Accessed September 23, 2020. doi:10.2307/764003.

*Recontextualizing Handel's Borrowing*, a journal article written by John T. Winemiller, synthesizes the earlier perspectives and writing that is in regard to what is called "Handel's Borrowing". This source provides a fairly modern perspective on the debate of borrowing in Handel's composition and will be useful in particular as a scholarly comparison of perspectives.

Wollenberg, Susan. "Handel and Gottlieb Muffat: A Newly Discovered Borrowing." *The Musical Times* 113, no. 1551 (1972): 448-49. Accessed September 13, 2020. doi:10.2307/955427.

More recently in 1972, Susan Wollenberg looked into some of the keyboard compositions written by Gottlieb Muffat and found that Handel's compositions were similar. Especially in *Componenti Musicali*, writers have found similarities between multiple movements of the piece and Handel's concerto Op. 7 No. 2. There are also more images and examples given to show evidence of each similarity found.